

Perspectives on Learning, Discourse, and Features of Generative Discourse

	Perspectives on learning					Approaches to analyzing discourse			Discourse practices					Social norms			Supporting structures	
	Learning is social	Discourse constitutes learning	Learning is situated	Learning is an outcome of PD	Learning not explicitly theorized/studied	Video Data	Coding	Talk in interaction	Revealing and probing problems of practice	Providing evidence or reasoning	Making connections to general principles	Building on others' ideas	Offering different perspectives	Mutual trust	Egalitarian inclusion	Dialogic stance	Facilitation	Video records
<b>Reference</b>																		
Adamson, B., & Walker, E. (2011). Messy collaboration: Learning from a Learning Study. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 27(1), 29-36. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.06.024					x								x		x			
Bae, C. L., Hayes, K. N., Seitz, J., O'Connor, D., & DiStefano, R. (2016). A coding tool for examining the substance of teacher professional learning and change with example cases from middle school science lesson study. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 60, 164-178. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.08.016				x		x	x						x					
Borko, H., Jacobs, J., Eiteljorg, E., & Pittman, M. E. (2008). Video as a tool for fostering productive discussions in mathematics professional development. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 24(2), 417-436. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.11.012	x	x	x														x	x
Brantlinger, A., Sherin, M. G., & Linsenmeier, K. A. (2011). Discussing discussion: a video club in the service of math teachers' National Board preparation. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 17(1), 5-33. doi:10.1080/13540602.2011.538494	x												x			x		x
Burke, A., & Collier, D. R. (2017). 'I was kind of teaching myself': teachers' conversations about social justice and teaching for change. <i>Teacher Development</i> , 21(2), 269-287. doi:10.1080/13664530.2016.1235607	x																	
Carfne, H. B., & Webb, S. M. (2006). On (not) overcoming our history of hierarchy: Complexities of university/school collaboration. <i>Science Education</i> , 90(3), 544-568. doi:10.1002/scs.20123		x	x					x							x			
Carroll, D. (2005). Learning through interactive talk: A school-based mentor teacher study group as a context for professional learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 21(5), 457-473. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2005.03.005	x	x				x		x			x	x	x				x	
Cohen, J. L. (2008). 'That's not treating you as a professional': Teachers constructing complex professional identities through talk. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 14(2), 79-93. doi:10.1080/13540600801965861					x			x										
Conca, L. M., Schechter, C. P., & Castle, S. (2004). Challenges teachers face as they work to connect assessment and instruction. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 10(1), 59-75. doi:10.1080/13540600320000170927					x			x										
Curry, M. (2008). Critical Friends Groups: The Possibilities and Limitations Embedded in Teacher Professional Communities Aimed at Instructional Improvement and School Reform. <i>Teachers College Record</i> , 110(4), 733-774.					x	x	x									x		
Curwood, J. S. (2014). English Teachers' Cultural Models About Technology A Microethnographic Perspective on Professional Development. <i>Journal of Literacy Research</i> , 46(1), 9-38. doi:10.1177/1086296x13520426	x		x			x		x					x					
Dobie, T. E., & Anderson, E. R. (2015). Interaction in teacher communities: Three forms teachers use to express contrasting ideas in video clubs. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 47, 230-240. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.01.003					x	x		x				x	x				x	
Dudley, P. (2013). Teacher learning in Lesson Study: What interaction-level discourse analysis revealed about how teachers utilised imagination, tacit knowledge of teaching and fresh evidence of pupils learning, to develop practice knowledge and so enhance their pupils' learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 34, 107-121. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.04.006	x	x	x										x					
Eddy Spicer, D. H. (2011). Power and knowledge-building in teacher inquiry: negotiating interpersonal and ideational difference. <i>Language and Education</i> , 25(1), 1-17. doi:10.1080/09500782.2010.504853	x	x						x				x	x					
English, B. (2009). Who is responsible for educating English language learners? Discursive construction of roles and responsibilities in an inquiry community. <i>Language and Education</i> , 23(6), 487-507. doi:10.1080/09500780902954216					x			x								x		
Fairbanks, C. M., & LaGrone, D. (2006). Learning together: Constructing knowledge in a teacher research group. <i>Teacher Education Quarterly</i> , 33(3), 7-25.	x	x						x	x			x	x					
Glazier, J. A. (2009). The challenge of repositioning: Teacher learning in the company of others. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 25(6), 826-834. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2008.11.014	x	x	x					x	x						x			

## Perspectives on Learning, Discourse, and Features of Generative Discourse

	Perspectives on learning					Approaches to analyzing discourse			Discourse practices					Social norms			Supporting structures	
	Learning is social	Discourse constitutes learning	Learning is situated	Learning is an outcome of PD	Learning not explicitly theorized/studied	Video Data	Coding	Talk in interaction	Revealing and probing problems of practice	Providing evidence or reasoning	Making connections to general principles	Building on others' ideas	Offering different perspectives	Mutual trust	Egalitarian inclusion	Dialogic stance	Facilitation	Video records
<b>Reference</b>																		
Goh, R., & Fang, Y. (2017). Improving English language teaching through lesson study Case study of teacher learning in a Singapore primary school grade level team. <i>International Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies</i> , 6(2), 135-150. doi:10.1108/ijlls-11-2015-0037	x		x				x									x	x	
Gonzalez, G., Deal, J. T., & Skultety, L. (2016). Facilitating Teacher Learning When Using Different Representations of Practice. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 67(5), 447-466. doi:10.1177/0022487116669573	x					x	x									x	x	x
Havnes, A. (2009). Talk, planning and decision-making in interdisciplinary teacher teams: A case study. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 15(1), 155-176. doi:10.1080/13540600802661360	x	x				x		x					x		x			
He, A. E. (2009). Bridging the gap between teacher educator and teacher in a community of practice: A case of brokering. <i>System</i> , 37(1), 153-163. doi:10.1016/j.system.2008.06.006	x							x									x	
Helstad, K., & Lund, A. (2012). Teachers' talk on students' writing: Negotiating students' texts in interdisciplinary teacher teams. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 28(4), 599-608. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2012.01.004	x	x						x					x			x	x	
Hom, I. S. (2010). Teaching Replays, Teaching Rehearsals, and Re-Visions of Practice: Learning From Colleagues in a Mathematics Teacher Community. <i>Teachers College Record</i> , 112(1), 225-259.	x	x				x		x			x							
Hom, I. S., & Kane, B. D. (2015). Opportunities for Professional Learning in Mathematics Teacher Workgroup Conversations: Relationships to Instructional Expertise. <i>Journal of the Learning Sciences</i> , 24(3), 373-418. doi:10.1080/1058406.2015.1034865	x	x				x	x	x			x							
Hom, I. S., & Little, J. W. (2010). Attending to Problems of Practice: Routines and Resources for Professional Learning in Teachers' Workplace Interactions. <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> , 47(1), 181-217. doi:10.3102/0002831209345158	x	x				x		x			x							
Hom, I. S., Gamer, B., Kane, B. D., & Brasel, J. (2017). A Taxonomy of Instructional Learning Opportunities in Teachers' Workgroup Conversations. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 68(1), 41-54. doi:10.1177/0022487116676315	x					x	x	x				x				x		
Hom, I. S., Kane, B. D., & Wilson, J. (2015). Making Sense of Student Performance Data: Data Use Logics and Mathematics Teachers' Learning Opportunities. <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> , 52(2), 208-242. doi:10.3102/0002831215573773	x	x				x	x	x				x						
Hung, H.-T., & Yeh, H.-C. (2013). Foming a change environment to encourage professional development through a teacher study group. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 36, 153-165. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.07.009				x				x									x	
Hunt, C. S. (2016). Getting to the heart of the matter: Discursive negotiations of emotions within literacy coaching interactions. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 60, 331-343. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.09.004					x	x		x						x	x			
Jewett, P., & Goldstein, N. (2008). Catching sight of talk: Glimpses into discourse groups. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 24(5), 1232-1243. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2007.05.002	x	x										x	x	x	x		x	
Kintz, T., Lane, J., Gotwals, A., & Cisterna, D. (2015). Professional development at the local level: Necessary and sufficient conditions for critical collegueship. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 51, 121-136. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.06.004	x			x		x	x				x	x	x				x	
Kosko, K. W., & Herbst, P. (2012). A deeper look at how teachers say what they say: A quantitative modality analysis of teacher-to-teacher talk. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 28(4), 589-598. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2011.11.010					x			x										
Kuusisaari, H. (2013). Teachers collaborative learning-development of teaching in group discussions. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 19(1), 50-62. doi:10.1080/13540602.2013.744198	x					x	x											
Lambson, D. (2010). Novice teachers learning through participation in a teacher study group. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 26(8), 1660-1668. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.06.017	x																x	
Lefstein, A., Trachtenberg-Maslato, R., & Pollak, I. (2017). Breaking out of the grips of dichotomous discourse in teacher post observation debrief conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 67, 418-428. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2017.07.010					x			x								x		x

## Perspectives on Learning, Discourse, and Features of Generative Discourse

Reference	Perspectives on learning					Approaches to analyzing discourse			Discourse practices					Social norms			Supporting structures	
	Learning is social	Discourse constitutes learning	Learning is situated	Learning is an outcome of PD	Learning not explicitly theorized/studied	Video Data	Coding	Talk in interaction	Revealing and probing problems of practice	Providing evidence or reasoning	Making connections to general principles	Building on others' ideas	Offering different perspectives	Mutual trust	Egalitarian inclusion	Dialogic stance	Facilitation	Video records
Leko, M. M., Kiely, M. T., Brownell, M. T., Ospova, A., Dingle, M. P., & Mundy, C. A. (2015). Understanding Special Educators' Learning Opportunities in Collaborative Groups: The Role of Discourse. <i>Teacher Education and Special Education</i> , 38(2), 138-157. doi:10.1177/0888406414557283	x	x	x			x	x	x			x							
Levine, T. H., & Marcus, A. S. (2010). How the structure and focus of teachers' collaborative activities facilitate and constrain teacher learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 26(3), 389-398. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2009.03.001	x						x	x									x	
Little, J. W. (2002). Locating learning in teachers' communities of practice: opening up problems of analysis in records of everyday work. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 18(8), 917-946.	x	x	x			x		x							x	x		
Louie, N. L. (2016). Tensions in equity- and reform-oriented learning in teachers' collaborative conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 53, 10-19. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.10.001	x	x	x				x	x		x	x					x		
Mausethagen, S. (2013). Talking about the test. Boundary work in primary school teachers' interactions around national testing of student performance. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 36, 132-142.					x			x										
McCotter, S. S. (2001). Collaborative groups as professional development. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 17(6), 685-704. doi:10.1016/s0742-051x(01)00024-5					x								x					
Melville, W., & Wallace, J. (2007). Metaphorical duality: High school subject departments as both communities and organizations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 23(7), 1193-1205. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.10.002	x												x	x				
O'Donnell-Allen, C. (2001). Teaching with a questioning mind: The development of a teacher research group into a discourse community. <i>Research in the Teaching of English</i> , 36(2), 161-211.	x	x				x	x	x					x	x		x		
Paugh, P. C., & Dudley-Marling, C. (2011). 'Speaking' deficit into (or out of) existence: how language constrains classroom teachers' knowledge about instructing diverse learners. <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> , 15(8), 819-833. doi:10.1080/13603110903437144					x			x					x					
Peercy, M. M., Martin-Beltran, M., Silverman, R. D., & Daniel, S. (2015). Curricular design and implementation as a site of teacher expertise and learning. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 21(7), 867-893. doi:10.1080/13540602.2014.995486	x		x			x		x					x		x			
Pehmer, A. K., Groschner, A., & Seidel, T. (2015). Fostering and scaffolding student engagement in productive classroom discourse: Teachers' practice changes and reflections in light of teacher professional development. <i>Learning Culture and Social Interaction</i> , 7, 12-27. doi:10.1016/j.lcsi.2015.05.001				x		x												x
Philip, T. M., Way, W., Garcia, A. D., Schuler-Brown, S., & Navarro, O. (2013). When educators attempt to make "community" a part of classroom learning: The dangers of (mis)appropriating students' communities into schools. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 34, 174-183. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.04.011					x	x	x						x					
Philpott, C., & Oates, C. (2017). Teacher agency and professional learning communities; what can Learning Rounds in Scotland teach us? <i>Professional Development in Education</i> , 43(3), 318-333. doi:10.1080/19415257.2016.1180316					x				x	x			x					
Popp, J. S., & Goldman, S. R. (2016). Knowledge building in teacher professional learning communities: Focus of meeting matters. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 59, 347-359. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.06.007	x	x					x		x							x		
Puchner, L. D., & Taylor, A. R. (2006). Lesson study, collaboration and teacher efficacy: Stories from two school-based math lesson study groups. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 22(7), 922-934. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.04.011				x											x	x		
Rousseau, C. K. (2004). Shared beliefs, conflict, and a retreat from reform: the story of a professional community of high school mathematics teachers. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 20(8), 783-796. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2004.09.005					x											x		
Saunders, W., Goldenberg, C., & Hamann, J. (1992). Instructional conversations beget instructional conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 8(2), 199-218. doi:10.1016/0742-051x(92)90009-t				x				x	x		x						x	

Perspectives on Learning, Discourse, and Features of Generative Discourse

	Perspectives on learning					Approaches to analyzing discourse			Discourse practices					Social norms			Supporting structures	
	Learning is social	Discourse constitutes learning	Learning is situated	Learning is an outcome of PD	Learning not explicitly theorized/studied	Video Data	Coding	Talk in interaction	Revealing and probing problems of practice	Providing evidence or reasoning	Making connections to general principles	Building on others' ideas	Offering different perspectives	Mutual trust	Egalitarian inclusion	Dialogic stance	Facilitation	Video records
<b>Reference</b>																		
Scribner, J. P., Sawyer, R. K., Watson, S. T., & Myers, V. L. (2007). Teacher teams and distributed leadership: A study of group discourse and collaboration. <i>Educational Administration Quarterly</i> , 43(1), 67-100. doi:10.1177/0013161x06293631					x	x	x											
Shank, M. J. (2006). Teacher storytelling: A means for creating and learning within a collaborative space. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 22(6), 711-721. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.03.002	x	x							x		x			x		x		
Sherin, M. G., & Han, S. Y. (2004). Teacher learning in the context of a video club. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 20(2), 163-183. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2003.08.001				x		x	x										x	x
Sherin, M. G., Linsenmeier, K. A., & van Es, E. A. (2009). Selecting Video Clips to Promote Mathematics Teachers' Discussion of Student Thinking. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 60(3), 213-230. doi:10.1177/0022487109336967	x					x	x			x		x						x
Slavit, D., Nelson, T. H., & Deuel, A. (2013). Teacher Groups' Conceptions and Uses of Student-Learning Data. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 64(1), 8-21. doi:10.1177/0022487112445517	x						x				x					x	x	
Steeg, S. M. (2016). A Case Study of Teacher Reflection: Examining Teacher Participation in a Video-Based Professional Learning Community. <i>Journal of Language and Literacy Education</i> , 12 (1), 122-141.	x	x							x					x		x		x
Tan, Y. S. M., & Caleon, I. S. (2016). Problem Finding in Professional Learning Communities: A Learning Study Approach. <i>Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research</i> , 60(2), 127-146. doi:10.1080/00313831.2014.996596	x					x							x				x	
Tang, X., & Shao, F. (2014). On the Evolution of a Lesson: Group Preparation for Teaching Contest as Teacher Professional Development Activity for Chinese Elementary Science Teachers. <i>Journal of Science Education and Technology</i> , 23(2), 252-266. doi:10.1007/s10956-013-9454-8	x					x	x								x			
Vrkkki, M., Warwick, P., Vermunt, J. D., Mercer, N., & Van Halem, N. (2017). Teacher learning in the context of Lesson Study: A video-based analysis of teacher discussions. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 61, 211-224. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.10.014	x	x				x	x			x		x	x					
Warwick, P., Vrkkki, M., Vermunt, J. D., Mercer, N., & van Halem, N. (2016). Connecting observations of student and teacher learning: an examination of dialogic processes in Lesson Study discussions in mathematics. <i>Zdm-Mathematics Education</i> , 48(4), 555-569. doi:10.1007/s11858-015-0750-z	x	x				x	x			x		x	x					
Zhang, M., Lundeborg, M., & Eberhardt, J. (2011). Strategic Facilitation of Problem-Based Discussion for Teacher Professional Development. <i>Journal of the Learning Sciences</i> , 20(3), 342-394. doi:10.1080/10508406.2011.553258	x			x		x	x	x			x		x				x	
Zoethout, H., Wesselink, R., Runhaar, P., & Mulder, M. (2017). Using Transactivity to Understand Emergence of Team Learning. <i>Small Group Research</i> , 48(2), 190-214. doi:10.1177/1046496417691614	x	x				x	x					x	x					
<b>TOTAL</b>	41	24	10	8	16	30	36	27	6	9	12	13	25	7	11	18	17	8
<b>PERCENTAGE (or average)</b>	64%	38%	16%	13%	25%	47%	56%	42%	9%	14%	19%	20%	39%	11%	17%	28%	27%	13%

## Study Design

Reference	Stage / relationship to research			Sites and participants				Facilitation				Type of group						Disciplinary focus				Grade level		Sample size									
	Pre-existing group(s)	New group(s) formed by researchers	New group(s) not formed by researchers	School-based groups	cross-school	# of groups	# of teachers	None	Teacher leader	administrator or coach	Researcher	Video Club	Lesson Study	study group	inquiry	PD course incl. coaching	workgroup	Other	math	science	Language (L1) / literacy / literature	Language (ELL/ESOL)	inter-disciplinary	other	Elementary	Secondary	number of meetings	total hours data collected	hours of data analyzed	meetings per team collected	hours per team analyzed		
Adamsen, B., & Walker, E. (2011). Messy collaboration: Learning from a Learning Study. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 27(1), 29-36. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.06.024			x	x		1	4			x		x										x			x	M	M	M					
Bae, C. L., Hayes, K. N., Seitz, J., O'Connor, D., & DiStefano, R. (2016). A coding tool for examining the substance of teacher professional learning and change with example cases from middle school science lesson study. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 60, 164-178. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.08.016					x	3	17			x		x								x					x	15	28.6	5.7	5	1.9			
Borke, H., Jacobs, J., Eiteljorg, E., & Pittman, M. E. (2008). Video as a tool for fostering productive discussions in mathematics professional development. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 24(2), 417-436. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.11.012		x			x	1	11				x								x						x	14	120	3.8	14	3.8			
Brantlinger, A., Sherin, M. G., & Linsenmeier, K. A. (2011). Discussing discussion: a video club in the service of math teachers' National Board preparation. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 17(1), 5-33. doi:10.1080/13540602.2011.538494			x	x		1	6			x		x							x						x	16	16	16	16	16			
Burke, A., & Collier, D. R. (2017). 'I was kind of teaching myself': teachers' conversations about social justice and teaching for change. <i>Teacher Development</i> , 21(2), 269-287. doi:10.1080/13664530.2016.1235607		x			x	1	12				x		x												x	x	3	6	4	3	4		
Carlone, H. B., & Webb, S. M. (2006). On (not) overcoming our history of hierarchy: Complexities of university/school collaboration. <i>Science Education</i> , 90(3), 544-568. doi:10.1002/sce.20123	x			x		1	5			x						x										x	8	24	9	8	9		
Carroll, D. (2005). Learning through interactive talk: A school-based mentor teacher study group as a context for professional learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 21(5), 457-473. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2005.03.005		x			x	1	5				x			x												x	9	22.5	22.5	9	22.5		
Cohen, J. L. (2008). 'That's not treating you as a professional': Teachers constructing complex professional identities through talk. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 14(2), 79-93. doi:10.1080/1354060801965861		x			x	1	3				x						x						x			x	M	M	1		1		
Conna, L. M., Schechter, C. P., & Castle, S. (2004). Challenges teachers face as they work to connect assessment and instruction. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 10(1), 59-75. doi:10.1080/13540600320000170927		x				5	22							x							x					x	40	40	10	8	2		
Curry, M. (2008). Critical Friends Groups: The Possibilities and Limitations Embedded in Teacher Professional Communities Aimed at Instructional Improvement and School Reform. <i>Teachers College Record</i> , 110(4), 733-774.	x				x	6	54			x				x												x	11	35	30	1.8	5		
Curwood, J. S. (2014). English Teachers' Cultural Models About Technology: A Microethnographic Perspective on Professional Development. <i>Journal of Literacy Research</i> , 46(1), 9-36. doi:10.1177/1082296x13520429		x			x	1	5			x			x													x	20	20	0.07	20	0.07		
Dobie, T. E., & Anderson, E. R. (2015). Interaction in teacher communities: Three forms teachers use to express contrasting ideas in video clubs. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 47, 230-240. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.01.003		x			x	3	17				x															x	9	27	9	3	3		
Dudley, P. (2013). Teacher learning in Lesson Study: What interaction-level discourse analysis revealed about how teachers utilized imagination, tacit knowledge of teaching and fresh evidence of pupils learning, to develop practice knowledge and so enhance their pupils' learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 34, 107-121. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.04.006	M	M	M			2	5	x				x														x	M	M	4		2		
Eddy Spicer, D. H. (2011). Power and knowledge-building in teacher inquiry: negotiating interpersonal and ideational difference. <i>Language and Education</i> , 25(1), 1-17. doi:10.1080/09500782.2010.504853	?				x	1	4			x																	x	M	M	M			
English, B. (2009). Who is responsible for educating English language learners? Discursive construction of roles and responsibilities in an inquiry community. <i>Language and Education</i> , 23(6), 487-507. doi:10.1080/09500780902854216		x				1	4				x			x													x	10	20	20	10	20	
Fairbanks, C. M., & LaGrone, D. (2006). Learning together: Constructing knowledge in a teacher research group. <i>Teacher Education Quarterly</i> , 33(3), 7-25.		x				1	7				x																x	3	18	18	3	18	
Glazier, J. A. (2009). The challenge of repositioning: Teacher learning in the company of others. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 25(6), 826-834. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2008.11.014		x				1	5	x					x														x	M	M	M			
Goh, R., & Fang, Y. (2017). Improving English language teaching through lesson study Case study of teacher learning in a Singapore primary school grade level team. <i>International Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies</i> , 6(2), 135-150. doi:10.1080/110811611201520327		x				1	11					x															x	8	8	8	8	8	
Gonzalez, G., Deal, J. T., & Skulley, L. (2016). Facilitating Teacher Learning When Using Different Representations of Practice. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 67(5), 447-466. doi:10.1177/0022487116689573						1	5					x	x														x	10	30	24	10	24	
Havnes, A. (2009). Talk, planning and decision-making in interdisciplinary teacher teams: A case study. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 15(1), 155-176. doi:10.1080/13540600802661560	x					2	?			x																	x	24	24	24	12	12	
He, A. E. (2009). Bridging the gap between teacher educator and teacher in a community of practice: A case of brokering. <i>System</i> , 37(1), 153-163. doi:10.1016/j.system.2008.06.006		x				1	4				x																x	M	M	M			
Helstad, K., & Lund, A. (2012). Teachers' talk on students' writing: Negotiating students' texts in interdisciplinary teacher teams. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 28(4), 599-606. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2012.01.004			x			1	11	x						x													x	13	13	0.5	13	0.5	
Horn, I. S. (2010). Teaching Replays, Teaching Rehearsals, and Revisions of Practice: Learning From Colleagues in a Mathematics Teacher Community. <i>Teachers College Record</i> , 112(1), 225-259.	x					1	6			x																	x	28	100	M	28		
Horn, I. S., & Kane, B. D. (2015). Opportunities for Professional Learning in Mathematics Teacher Workgroup Conversations: Relationships to Instructional Expertise. <i>Journal of the Learning Sciences</i> , 24(3), 373-418. doi:10.1080/10580466.2015.1034465		x				3	16	x			x																	x	14	17	17	4.7	5.7
Horn, I. S., & Lobb, J. W. (2010). Attending to Problems of Practice: Routines and Resources for Professional Learning in Teachers' Workplace Interactions. <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> , 47(1), 161-217. doi:10.3102/0002831209345158	x					2	13			x																		x	50	112	52	25	26

## Study Design

Reference	Stage / relationship to research			Sites and participants				Facilitation				Type of group						Disciplinary focus					Grade level		Sample size							
	Pre-existing group(s)	New group(s) formed by researchers	New group(s) not formed by researchers	School-based groups	cross-school	# of groups	# of teachers	None	Teacher leader	administrator or coach	Researcher	Video Club	Lesson Study	study group	inquiry	PD course incl. coaching	workgroup	Other	math	science	Language (L1) / literacy / literature	Language (ELL/2/ESL)	inter-disciplinary	other	Elementary	Secondary	number of meetings	total hours data collected	hours of data analyzed	meetings per team collected	hours per team analyzed	
Horn, I. S., Garner, B., Kane, B. D., & Brasel, J. (2017). A Taxonomy of Instructional Learning Opportunities in Teachers' Workgroup Conversations. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 68(1), 41-54. doi:10.1177/0022487116678315	x			x		24	M			x						x			x						x		111	101	70	4.6	2.9	
Horn, I. S., Kane, B. D., & Wilson, J. (2015). Making Sense of Student Performance Data: Data Use Logics and Mathematics Teachers' Learning Opportunities. <i>American Educational Research Journal</i> , 52(2), 208-242. doi:10.3102/0002831215573773	x			x		2	13	x		x						x									x		8	5.3	5.3	4	2.7	
Hung, H.-T., & Yeh, H.-C. (2013). Forming a change environment to encourage professional development through a teacher study group. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 36, 153-165. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.07.009	x			x		1	5			x					x							x			x		9	27	27	9	27	
Hunt, C. S. (2016). Getting to the heart of the matter: Discursive negotiations of emotions within literacy coaching interactions. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 60, 331-343. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.09.004	x			x		4	6			x											x				x	x	4	2	2	1	0.5	
Jewett, P., & Goldstein, N. (2008). Catching sight of talk: Glances into discourse groups. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 24(5), 1232-1243. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2007.05.002	x			x		1	18			x															x	x	16	16	16	16	16	
Kintz, T., Lane, J., Gotwals, A., & Cisterna, D. (2015). Professional development at the local level: Necessary and sufficient conditions for critical collegiality. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 51, 121-136. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.06.004	x			x		12	78		x					x									x			x	x	76	107	74	6.3	6.2
Kosko, K. W., & Herbst, P. (2012). A deeper look at how teachers say what they say: A quantitative modality analysis of teacher-to-teacher talk. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 28(4), 589-598. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2011.11.010	x					1	6			x	x								x						x		11	11	1	11	1	
Kuussiant, H. (2013). Teachers collaborative learning-development of teaching in group discussions. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 19(1), 50-62. doi:10.1080/13540602.2013.744198	x			x		2	6			x				x													4	42	2.3	2	1.1	
Lambson, D. (2010). Novice teachers learning through participation in a teacher study group. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 26(8), 1668-1688. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2010.06.017	x			x		1	10			x											x					x		14	17.5	17.5	14	17.5
Lefstein, A., Trachtenberg-Masterson, R., & Pollak, I. (2017). Breaking out of the grips of dichotomous discourse in teacher post observation debrief conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 67, 418-428. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2017.07.010	x			x		1	10	x						x											x		21	20	9.5	21	9.5	
Leke, M. M., Kley, M. T., Browne, M. T., Ospova, A., Dingle, M. P., & Mandy, C. A. (2015). Understanding Special Educators' Learning Opportunities in Collaborative Groups: The Role of Discourse. <i>Teacher Education and Special Education</i> , 38(2), 138-157. doi:10.1177/0888406414557283	x			x		2	9			x											x						8	12	12	4	6	
Levine, T. H., & Marcus, A. S. (2010). How the structure and focus of teachers' collaborative activities facilitate and constrain teacher learning. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 26(3), 389-398. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2009.03.001		x		x		1	7																x			x	37	37	37	37	37	
Little, J. W. (2002). Locating learning in teachers' communities of practice: opening up problems of analysis in records of everyday work. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 18(6), 917-946.	x			x		1	5		x																x		10	15	0.3	10	0.3	
Louie, N. L. (2016). Tensions in equity and reform-oriented learning in teachers' collaborative conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 53, 10-19. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2015.10.001	x			x		1	10	x																	x		29	29	29	29	29	
Mausethagen, S. (2013). Talking about the test: Boundary work in primary school teachers' interactions around national testing of student performance. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 36, 132-142. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.07.010	x			x		2	22			x															x		25	25	5	12.5	2.5	
McCotter, S. S. (2001). Collaborative groups as professional development. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 17(6), 685-704. doi:10.1016/s0742-051x(01)00024-5	x			x		1	6	x																		x	x	8	8	8	8	8
Melville, W., & Wallace, J. (2007). Metaphorical duality: High school subject departments as both communities and organizations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 23(7), 1193-1205. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.10.002	x			x		1	10		x																	x		20	20	20	20	20
O'Donnell-Allen, C. (2001). Teaching with a questioning mind: The development of a teacher research group into a discourse community. <i>Research in the Teaching of English</i> , 35(2), 161-211.	x			x		1	7		x																	x	x	M	M	M		
Paugh, P. G., & Dudley-Marling, C. (2011). 'Speaking' deficit into (or out of) existence: how language constrains classroom teachers' knowledge about instructing diverse learners. <i>International Journal of Inclusive Education</i> , 15(8), 819-833. doi:10.1080/13603110903437144	x			x		1	4							x												x		M	M	M		
Peercy, M. M., Martin-Beltran, M., Silverman, R. D., & Daniel, S. (2015). Curricular design and implementation as a site of teacher expertise and learning. <i>Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice</i> , 21(7), 867-893. doi:10.1080/13540602.2014.954666	x			x		1	8							x												x		10	15	M	10	
Pehmer, A. K., Groschner, A., & Seidel, T. (2015). Fostering and scaffolding student engagement in productive classroom discourse: Teachers' practice changes and reflections in light of teacher professional development. <i>Learning Culture and Social Interaction</i> , 7, 12-27. doi:10.1016/j.lcsi.2015.05.001	x			x		2	10			x					x											x		6	12	12	3	6
Philip, T. M., Way, W., Garcia, A. D., Schuler-Brown, S., & Navarro, O. (2013). When educators attempt to make 'community' a part of classroom learning: The dangers of (mis)appropriating students' communities into schools. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 34, 174-183. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2013.04.011	x			x		5	14			x																x		7	42	10	1.4	2
Philpott, C., & Oates, C. (2017). Teacher agency and professional learning communities: what can Learning Rounds in Scotland teach us? <i>Professional Development in Education</i> , 43(3), 319-333. doi:10.1080/19415257.2016.1180316	x			x		4	24		x					x												x	x	4	4	4	1	1
Popp, J. S., & Goldman, S. R. (2016). Knowledge building in teacher professional learning communities: Focus of meeting matters. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 59, 347-359. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.06.007	x			x		3	24			x				x												x		67	67	9	22.3	3
Puchner, L. D., & Taylor, A. R. (2006). Lesson study, collaboration and teacher efficacy: Stories from two school-based math lesson study groups. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 22(7), 922-934. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.04.011	x			x		2	8		x	x																x		15	30	M	7.5	

Study Design

	Stage / relationship to research			Sites and participants				Facilitation				Type of group							Disciplinary focus					Grade level		Sample size										
	Pre-existing group(s)	New group(s) formed by researchers	New group(s) not formed by researchers	School-based groups	cross-school	# of groups	# of teachers	None	Teacher leader	administrator or coach	Researcher	Video Club	Lesson Study	study group	inquiry	PD course incl. coaching	workgroup	Other	math	science	Language (L1) / literacy / literature	Language (ELL/2FL)	inter-disciplinary	other	Elementary	Secondary	number of meetings	total hours data collected	hours of data analyzed	meetings per team collected	hours per team analyzed					
<b>Reference</b>																																				
Rousseau, C. K. (2004). Shared beliefs, conflict, and a retreat from reform: the story of a professional community of high school mathematics teachers. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 20(8), 783-796. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2004.09.005				x		1	5									x									x		M	M	M							
Saunders, W., Goldenberg, C., & Hamann, J. (1992). Instructional conversations beget instructional conversations. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 8(2), 199-218. doi:10.1016/0742-051x(92)90009-9	x			x		1	4			x				x										x		30	28	4	30	4						
Sorbner, J. P., Sawyer, R. K., Watson, S. T., & Myers, V. L. (2007). Teacher teams and distributed leadership: A study of group discourse and collaboration. <i>Educational Administration Quarterly</i> , 43(1), 67-100. doi:10.1177/0013161x06293611	x			x		2	13		x							x							x		x	18	12.1	12.1	9	6.1						
Shank, M. J. (2006). Teacher storytelling: A means for creating and learning within a collaborative space. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 22(6), 711-721. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2006.03.002			x	x		1	13			x				x									x		x	14	14	14	14	14						
Sherin, M. G., & Han, S. Y. (2004). Teacher learning in the context of a video club. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 20(2), 163-183. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2003.08.001			x	x		1	4			x	x								x					x		10	6.7	4.7	10	4.7						
Sherin, M. G., Linsenmeier, K. A., & van Es, E. A. (2009). Selecting Video Clips to Promote Mathematics Teachers' Discussion of Student Thinking. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 60(3), 213-230. doi:10.1177/0022487109339697			x	x		1	7			x	x								x					x		10	10	10	10	10						
Slavit, D., Nelson, T. H., & Dewet, A. (2013). Teacher Groups' Conceptions and Uses of Student-Learning Data. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 84(1), 8-21. doi:10.1177/0022487112445517	x			x		6	36		x					x					x	x					x		88	62	62	14.7	10.3					
Stieg, S. M. (2016). A Case Study of Teacher Reflection: Examining Teacher Participation in a Video-Based Professional Learning Community. <i>Journal of Language and Literacy Education</i> , 12 (1), 122-141.			x	x		1	4					x												x		6	6	6	6	6						
Tan, Y. S. M., & Caleon, I. S. (2016). Problem Finding in Professional Learning Communities: A Learning Study Approach. <i>Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research</i> , 60(2), 127-146. doi:10.1080/00313831.2014.996596			x	x		1	4			x		x													x		11	11	4	11	4					
Tang, X., & Shao, F. (2014). On the Evolution of a Lesson: Group Preparation for Teaching Contest as Teacher Professional Development Activity for Chinese Elementary Science Teachers. <i>Journal of Science Education and Technology</i> , 23(2), 252-266. doi:10.1007/s10956-013-0454-8				x		1	4					x												x		6	6	5	6	5						
Vrkkki, M., Warwick, P., Vermunt, J. D., Mercer, N., & Van Halem, N. (2017). Teacher learning in the context of Lesson Study: A video-based analysis of teacher discussions. <i>Teaching and Teacher Education</i> , 61, 211-224. doi:10.1016/j.tate.2016.10.014			x	x		30	91					x												x	x	60	60	4	2	0.1						
Warwick, P., Vrkkki, M., Vermunt, J. D., Mercer, N., & van Halem, N. (2016). Connecting observations of student and teacher learning: an examination of dialogic processes in Lesson Study discussions in mathematics. <i>Zdm-Mathematics Education</i> , 48(4), 555-569. doi:10.1007/s11858-015-0750-z			x	x		4	14					x												x	x	10	6.7	3	2.5	0.8						
Zhang, M., Lundeborg, M., & Eberhardt, J. (2011). Strategic Facilitation of Problem-Based Discussion for Teacher Professional Development. <i>Journal of the Learning Sciences</i> , 20(3), 342-394. doi:10.1080/10580406.2011.553258			x		x	4	35			x					x									x	x	6	12	12	1.5	3						
Zoethout, H., Wesselink, R., Runhaar, P., & Mulder, M. (2017). Using Transactivity to Understand Emergence of Team Learning. <i>Small Group Research</i> , 48(2), 190-214. doi:10.1177/1046496417691614	?			x		3	17		x	x						x									x		21	27.2	27.2	7	9.1					
<b>TOTAL</b>	18	34	6	49	15	177	823	8	20	12	26	7	11	6	16	7	16	1	21	9	15	6	12	1	31	43	1115	1607.6	817.4							
<b>PERCENTAGE (or average)</b>	28%	53%	9%	77%	23%	2.8	11.4	13%	31%	19%	41%	11%	17%	9%	25%	11%	25%	2%	33%	14%	23%	9%	19%	2%	48%	67%	19.6	32.2	16.6	10.5	8.5					